

## THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 30 November 2023 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated Friday, 24 November 2023.

Present: County Councillor Molik (Lord Mayor)

County Councillors Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hinchey, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, K Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lancaster, Latif, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Lloyd Jones, Mackie, McEvoy, McGarry, Melbourne, Merry, Michael, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Proctor, Reid-Jones, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Huw Thomas, Thomson, Lynda Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams, Wong and Wood

### 76 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Cllrs Saleh Ahmed, Brown-Reckless, Burke, Cunnah, Goodway, Hopkins, Jackie Jones, Lay and Moultrie.

### 77 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were received in accordance with the Members' Code of Conduct.

NAME	AGENDA ITEM NO	NATURE OF INTEREST	REASON FOR INTEREST
Cllr Jane Henshaw	8	Personal	Family member works for Social Services
Cllr Marc Palmer	8	Personal	Family member works for Social services

### 78 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting on 26 October 2023 were approved and signed by the Chair.

### 79 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

There were no public questions.

### 80 : PETITIONS

The following petitions were received:

Presented by	Number of relevant signatures	Nature of petition
Cllr Garry Hunt	30	Requesting measures to improve parking in Llanishen
Cllr Rodney Berman	1270	Calling for a referendum on any plans to introduce a congestion charge

## 81 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

November had seen a number of remembrance services, which is a reminder of those who gave up their lives for peace and to give us the life we enjoy today in this part of the world:

November was also a festive season for Cardiff's Sikh and Hindu communities, and she had attended many events and functions joining in with their celebrations of the triumph of good over evil and hope over dismay.

The Lord Mayor Mary thanked Cllr Williams and his family for arranging a coffee morning at their home to help raise funds for UCAN Productions, and those Councillors who also attended.

She highlighted the efforts of a number of leading ladies from Cardiff's diverse communities, including Thamina Khan, Mutalie Merrill, Sakina Jamal, Professor Meena Upadhyaya, Vimla Patel, Vilas Kerrai, Christina Roy, Maria Messa and Sudha Bhatt, as well as Cllrs Chowdhury and Sangani, for arranging a fantastic diner at Juboraj which raised more than £4000 for UCAN. She also thanked those Councillors who attended.

The Lord Mayor thanks Members for their support of her Charity and highlighted the upcoming fundraising events which includes:

- A charity football match by Bangladeshi Cardiff Team vs. London Team at 3pm on Sunday 3<sup>rd</sup> December at House of Sports, Clos Parc Morgannwg, to which all were welcome.
- The UCAN Concert on 19<sup>th</sup> December 7.30pm at Royal College of Music and Arts. There were 300 seats priced at £8 and £12, and it would be a great boost to all UCAN young people to fill the hall.
- A showcase of Indian and Bangladeshi vocalists, violinists and poetry at the Royal Welsh College Of Music & Drama at 6pm on 13<sup>th</sup> January. Anyone wishing to book a place for that event could contact Cllr Chowdhury.

## 82 : TREASURY MANAGEMENT ANNUAL REPORT MID YEAR REPORT

The report provided Council with information about the Council's Treasury Management activities since 1<sup>st</sup> April 2023 and the position as of 30<sup>th</sup> September 2023.

The report was proposed by Cllr Weaver and seconded by Cllr Thomas.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the recommendation.

FOR (63)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Humphreys, Hunt, Helen Lloyd Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lancaster, Latif, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Mackie, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Proctor, Reid-Jones, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams, Wong, Wood

AGAINST (1)

Councillor Sattar

There were no abstentions.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Note the Treasury Management Mid-Year Report 2023-24.

83 : LOCAL AUTHORITY SOCIAL SERVICES ANNUAL REPORT 2022/2023

Council was asked to consider the 14th Local Authority Social Services Annual Report, as required in accordance with Part 8 of the Social Services and Well-Being (Wales) Act 2014 (SSWB Act).

The report was proposed by Cllr Mackie and seconded by Cllr Lister.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the recommendation.

FOR (66)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Helen Lloyd Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lancaster, Latif, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Mackie, McGarry, Melbourne, Merry, Michael, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Proctor, Reid-Jones, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams, Wong, Wood

AGAINST (0)

There were no abstentions.

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Approve the Local Authority's Social Services Annual Report for 2022/23.

#### 84 : REVIEW OF POLLING DISTRICTS, PLACES AND STATIONS

Council was asked to approve changes to polling district and polling places in line with the Representation of the People Act 1983, which required local authorities to conduct a review every five years to ensure practicality and accessibility.

The report was proposed by Cllr Thomas and seconded by Cllr Merry.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the recommendations.

#### FOR (55)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Ebrahim, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Humphreys, Hunt, Helen Lloyd Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Latif, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Livesy, Mackie, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Naughton, Palmer, Proctor, Robinson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Thomas, Thomson, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Wong, Wood

#### AGAINST (0)

#### ABSTAIN (10)

Councillors Cowan, Davies, Driscoll, Elsmore, Lancaster, Littlechild, Owen, Reid-Jones, Robson, Williams

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

- a. Approve the 2 polling district and 13 polling place changes as noted in paragraph 12;
- b. Note that the Electoral Registration Officer would implement any consequential changes to the register of electors;
- c. Designate each polling place as within the general vicinity of each location utilised for polling station purposes; and delegate authority to the Returning Officer to make changes where necessary, for example, where a building became unavailable at short notice due to unforeseen circumstances, or where a more suitable building was identified;
- d. Make no other changes to the polling districts;
- e. Note that the Returning Officer shall confirm the polling stations within each polling district and place prior to elections, having regard to the proposals set out in paragraph 12 above and any other relevant factors pertaining at that time.

85 : REVISION OF ELECTED MEMBER LEARNING AND DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY (MANDATORY TRAINING)

Council was asked to give approval for amendments to be made to the Elected Member Learning and Development Strategy relating to mandatory training, to reflect the views of Council at its meeting on 29<sup>th</sup> June 2023 and recommendations made by the Democratic Services Committee at its meeting on 13<sup>th</sup> November 2023.

The report was proposed by Cllr Lancaster and seconded by Cllr Ferguson-Thorne.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the recommendations.

FOR (64)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Elsmore, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Helen Lloyd Jones, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lancaster, Latif, Lent, Lewis, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Mackie, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Proctor, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams, Wong, Wood

AGAINST (0)

ABSTAIN (1)

Councillor Melbourne

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

- a. Approve the recommendation of the Democratic Services Committee for the immediate revision of the Elected Member Learning and Development Strategy as shown at Appendix A, to include confirmation of the mandatory training courses as set out in paragraph 7b of this report;
- b. Note:
  - 1) that a review of the Elected Member Learning and Development Strategy will be undertaken in 2024 and the revised strategy will be submitted to Council for approval;
  - 2) the deadline of 29<sup>th</sup> December 2023 for Members to complete all mandatory training following the Local Government Elections in 2022.

86 : STANDARDS & ETHICS COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2022/2023

Council was provided with the Annual Report of the Standards & Ethics Committee, in line with the requirements of the Local Government and Elections (Wales) Act 2021, although it was noted that the Committee had presented an annual report to Council for more than 20 years prior to that Act.

The report was proposed by Jason Bartlett, Chair of the Standards & Ethics Committee.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Note the Standards & Ethics Committee Annual Report 2022/2023.

87 : GOVERNANCE & AUDIT COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2022/2023

This report was deferred to the next meeting of Council on 25<sup>th</sup> January 2024.

88 : CABINET STATEMENTS

Leader's Statement

Cllr Thomas responded to questions in relation to:

- the Real Living Wage;
- the South Wales Metro;
- Ysgol Y Berllan Degin's receipt of a School of Sanctuary award; and
- traffic mitigation following the opening of the new Fitzalan High School

Tackling Poverty, Equality & Public Health Statement

Cllrs Bradbury and Sangani responded to questions in relation to:

- the Youth Action Group for Whitchurch;
- combatting Islamophobia in Wales;
- protecting youth services from cuts; and
- bowel and prostate cancer awareness

Transport & Strategic Planning Statement

Cllr De'Ath responded to questions in relation to:

- the newly opened Canal Quarter;
- Cardiff Dogs Home; and
- the Registration Service's move to Insole Court

Education Statement

Cllr Merry responded to questions in relation to:

- the Children's Rights framework;
- the building of new schools across Cardiff; and
- a recent UNICEF Child-Friendly City event

Social Services Statement

Cllrs Mackie and Lister responded to questions in relation to:

- criminal child exploitation;

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

- the Age Friendly Forum and digital inclusion; and
- meeting statutory performance targets in children's services

#### Climate Change Statement

Cllr Wild responded to questions in relation to:

- flood defences on Radyr Court Road;
- the Greener Whitchurch project;
- measures to alleviate flooding following issues on Merthyr Road;
- Christmas tree, green bin and garden waste collections; and
- relations with Unite and the prevention of further industrial action

There were no questions in respect of Culture, Parks and Events Statement.

#### Finance, Modernisation & Performance Statement

Cllr Weaver responded to questions in relation to:

- the UK government's Autumn Statement;
- the accessibility of information regarding waste services; and
- the Welsh Government's budgetary plans

#### Housing & Communities Statement

Cllr Thorne responded to questions in relation to:

- the council's housing position;
- provision of warm and welcome spaces;
- applying intentionality when managing high demand for housing; and
- homelessness and temporary accommodation

#### Investment & Development

In Councillor Goodway's absence Cllr Thomas responded to questions in relation to:

- scrutiny arrangements for the Cardiff Capital Region Investment Zone;  
and
- how the new arena could take neurodiversity into account

## 89 : ORAL QUESTIONS

### *Councillor Robson to Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning*

What action will the Council take to improve safety for pedestrians and reduce the large number of HGV's in Beulah Road?

### *Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

Regarding Pantbach Road and Beulah Road, the Council have contacted companies whose fleets are still using those two roads, asking them if they can go down Caerphilly Road which has now had its temporary weight restriction removed rather than driving through Rhiwbina village. We've also bid to Welsh Government for funding for a crossing at the Pantbach/Beulah Road junction which is obviously very

heavily used by parents and schoolchildren daily on their way to school, so hopefully that will improve things for the community.

*Supplementary question – Cllr Robson*

I was very pleased to hear your answer that efforts are underway. I understand that the Council will need to undertake some survey work to ascertain the extent of the issue. This follows of course two accidents this year where HGV's have taken out the pedestrian safety barriers, and last week also took out a traffic light.

It is a very dangerous situation in my view, so I welcome the work that is being done. But in terms of the survey, could I implore, you as far as possible, that those surveys are conducted before Christmas so that we can get the ball rolling as quickly as possible on this, and then follow up once we know the outcomes of those surveys?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

Absolutely Councillor, we will try to get those done as soon as we physically can.

*Councillor Berman to Leader of Council*

Can you please fully update Members as to what action the Council has been taking to settle its dispute with Unite, and what hope can you offer to residents of the city that you have taken steps to ensure that there won't be further strike action by Unite in the new year, including further disruption to waste collection services?

*Reply – Cllr Thomas*

The dispute with Unite related to the national pay award 2023-24, which was settled between the national employers and GMB and Unison via collective bargaining on 1<sup>st</sup> November this year.

Despite this national agreement Unite continued their strike action in Cardiff until 26<sup>th</sup> November, but as there is an agreed pay award the Council has actioned this and employees will receive this together with back pay in their December payslips.

Unite are balloting their members in the Council's waste collection, cleansing and highway teams now regarding a number of local issues, about which myself and Cabinet Members and officers have met with them to discuss on a number of occasions. We have put forward a number of proposals to Unite as well as asking Unite for more information on a number of points that they have raised, and my sense is that the implementation of the proposals that we have put forward would make a substantial impact in addressing the genuine concerns held by Unite members within the Council, so we will need to see whether that is taken on board and reflected in the outcome of their ballot.

*Supplementary - Cllr Berman*

Can you assure you us that the Council is actually doing everything possible to try to discuss these concerns with Unite? I appreciate that you're saying that some things are decided nationally, but there are lots of other points of contention they have been raising, and I see from the answer to my written question that you've only formally met them to discuss the dispute on just a few occasions, which does seem a little bit staggering considering that they were on strike for 11 weeks. When I see the flyer



they've been putting out today, they've been talking about employers failing to engage constructively with them in relation to matters in dispute, they're talking about a breakdown in industrial relations. So we do seem to be getting different sides to this story, but what I'm not seeing is clear evidence that you are meaningfully trying to stop the disruption that has been caused to services in this city. So can you please assure us that the Council is doing everything to try to put an end to this strike?

*Reply – Cllr Thomas*

When it comes to the breakdown in industrial relations, I would point to the very excellent relationships that we've got with both Unison and GMB who are by far and away the biggest unions represented on this council, and I do want to echo the words of Cllr Wild earlier in thanking the members of those unions and the wider workforce who've continued to work during what has been a period of disruption. The apology has been made to residents and I will make it again, that we are sorry for the disruption. We respect people's right to go on strike; we don't want them to go on strike, but we understand there are genuinely held concerns, and we have met as the written answer points out on a number of occasions to try and resolve those issues. There are points of difference that continue but we will continue to try and resolve them and seek mediation if necessary as a way of resolving disputes.

*Councillor Stubbs to Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning*

How can women who wish to remain anonymous because of abuse or harassment engage with the planning system and object to applications without their details being published?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

You've raised a really important point. I know it's something you feel very strongly about, you've been pushing us to make changes in this regard for some time. The issue is that when someone makes a representation, a member of the public in the planning context, that's put online. So firstly, that puts off people more generally being uncomfortable with their personal details being accessible by other people, but particularly if you're someone experiencing harassment or stalking or domestic violence. There are considerable dangers and safeguarding issues around that. We're working with officers on that and we're looking to change our system so we no longer put public representations on our website. There'll be certain circumstances when they have to become available because of the law, but hopefully, it's a much better system which means people are far less vulnerable and much more able to engage with our systems.

*Supplementary – Cllr Stubbs*

I welcome the work being done. I think we're all aware, and it's well documented, the sort of lengths abusers will go in order to continue harassment, so I do welcome the work being done, I would just ask if there is anything, while this is taking place, if there is anything more we can do that's a bit more immediate?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

There is from this point onwards, if a particular individual requests that their information is kept away from the public arena, we will manually remove it from our systems so it can't be accessed. It's just one tiny action in a much broader piece of

work we're undertaking in making planning and transport far more gender aware and gender sensitive.

*Councillor Lancaster to Cabinet Member for Investment and Development*  
What is the Council doing to support Cardiff's night-time economy?

*Reply – Cllr Huw Thomas on behalf of Cllr Goodway*

There's a wide range of support provided to the city's night-time economy by the Council, and this includes direct funding and support, marketing and promotional work, as well as wider support through our partnerships to manage the issues that can often impact on the night-time economy sector. We've also continued to provide support within the city centre to help our hospitality sector to thrive.

In terms of direct support our Cardiff Growth Fund can provide up to £10,000 for businesses to invest in ways to make their businesses more productive and sustainable. You'll know about our work as a music city, and we've recently launched a Grassroots Venue Fund that provides funding for the city's grassroots cultural venues. Officials have also promoted current rates relief schemes that are on offer to the sector to ensure that as many of our eligible businesses as possible are claiming the 75% rates relief offered. You've then got the Transforming Towns scheme through which we have also supported investment in a number of night-time economy sector businesses in the city, supporting the regeneration or refurbishment of empty or underutilised spaces, with a number being refurbished for hospitality purposes as a result. Our Visit Cardiff website also promotes our night-time economy, showcasing some of our best attractions, entertainment and hospitality our city has to offer, and of course we work with our partners such as For Cardiff, to ensure that Cardiff is a welcoming place for night-time economy patrons, and of course the Council is a key stakeholder and contributor to the Purple Flag evening and night-time economy group, which has gained and maintained Purple Flag status annually since 2019.

*Supplementary – Cllr Lancaster*

A key part of what we offer as a night-time economy is our music offering which you alluded to, as well as the ability to put on large-scale gigs and sporting events, and a key part of the success of those is the ability to get to and from those events in a sustainable manner offering sustainable transport. I must admit I smiled earlier when Cllr Green mentioned the Welsh Government's commitment to rail infrastructure. I think his irony filter must be broken, because only a couple of weeks ago we had the announcement that the Welsh Government was pulling out of plans to support railway depots near Newport, which would have been specifically used to provide sustainable railway transport to and from Cardiff for the events that we wish to put on. Will you join in me condemning the Welsh Government's decision to damage our economy yet again, and what else are you going to do about it?

*Reply – Cllr Thomas*

Thank you for mentioning music in your supplementary because I didn't have a chance in my main answer to mention the indoor arena, you may have heard of it, that this Council is bringing forward with Live Nation, which will be a 15,000 capacity arena, which will have 100 events per year of live music; £100 million being brought

into the Cardiff economy, clearly most of that being spent within the night-time economy.

On your point about public transport, connectivity and especially at night, that is a well-made point, and I was also disappointed that Welsh Government did not proceed with that plan at Llanwern as a means of getting mass numbers away from stadium events. Obviously, musical events in the arena will be of a smaller scale, but it is identified and actually we had a very good discussion in a Music Board event for the public we held in Clwb Ifor Bach a few months ago around the need for later running trains and later running bus services as well. I think we all understand in this room the pressures on both those modes of public transport at the moment, but certainly in the long term we want to see the extension of those types of route at those times to give people other options than just driving to access the night-time economy.

*Councillor Wood to Cabinet Member for Climate Change*

Will the Council commit to making a Christmas tree waste collection at the end of this festive season?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

Christmas tree collections are planned for the weeks commencing 8<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup> of January with the collection scheduled for the alternate week to when black bin or bag collections will take place. Residents can also take their Christmas trees to the recycling centres and there'll be a Christmas tree drop-off zone in Heath Park car park on 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> of January.

*Councillor Michael to Chair of Planning Committee*

Planning is a rule-based system and all planning decisions are undertaken under planning law and guidance as they are at present. In your view, should passing retrospective regulations and advice, be used to delay or refuse decisions taken lawfully by this Council's Planning Committee?

*Reply – Cllr Stubbs*

As you know, all the decisions we make are based around planning law, planning rules, from our Local Plan as well. But where policies, for example we've got a new LDP coming, we will review decisions that are ongoing based on those changes. We do sometimes delay decisions because we put conditions in place, but I think what's important is that there is full transparency of the system, and that decisions are taken in a timely manner. What no-one in this Chamber would want to see are investment decisions delayed because we were unable to make decisions in a timely manner.

*Supplementary – Cllr Michael*

Does he agree with me that one of the biggest issues that we have at present, not only in this locality but the whole country, is the actual time it takes for major projects to be given the go-ahead? Because projects, especially in my ward, that are transformative, not only to transport but 6,000 well-paid jobs, with huge investment into this region, are being delayed, and I think it's about time certainly in this country that we actually got to the stage where we're actually working and helping applications rather than delaying them.

*Reply – Cllr Stubbs*

I can just reiterate what I said at the end, I don't think it's in anyone's interest, wherever you are in Wales, whatever level of governance, that decisions go on too long. If you want to encourage investment, you must be willing, whether it's a positive or negative decision, to take that decision, so those who are often funding quite large sums of investment in difficult times, because inflation is high, costs are becoming high, can have confidence that people are willing to take those decisions.

*Councillor Davies to Chair of Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee*

Is it not an appropriate question for a Scrutiny Committee to ask the Cabinet Member before it about the suitability of an organisation to receive public funds to deliver youth services when the report being discussed is about the delivery of youth services and mentions said organisation and its receipt of taxpayers' money?

*Reply – Cllr Bridgeman*

I would reaffirm the position that I conveyed to you at the meeting of the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee on the 14<sup>th</sup> of November. As Chair I felt the question you asked was not appropriate as we were there to discuss the report before the Committee about the Council's youth services, not the views of another organisation.

*Supplementary – Cllr Davies*

That's quite an odd answer, because one of the organisations mentioned in the report is getting public money, so why should I be unable to ask about that? I provided the context of the issue for the benefit of the Cabinet Member so they would know what I was talking about, but yes you prevented me from asking this completely appropriate question so got no answer. The political view expressed is not even what is relevant here. Cardiff taxpayers will want to know why the Council, if it does, thinks it's appropriate to fund politically active organisations to deliver youth services. So my supplementary to you would be, as a Committee chair, how would you alter the way you chair meetings so Committee members can do their job and provide the scrutiny residents demand of us?

*Reply – Cllr Bridgeman*

So as we are aware there, Cllr Davies, this is not the first time I've had to interrupt your questioning due to it not being appropriate. I would urge to attend pre-meetings of the Scrutiny so that situations like this can be prevented in the future.

*Councillor Berman to Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning*

Would you agree that prior to significant roadworks being undertaken to a prominent road junction, including on situated on key routes, that a) ward councillors and b) local communities, should be both notified and consulted in advance of these works taking place, and that the Council should explain the rationale for such works, as well as for any modifications to the junction that may be being introduced?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

Cllr Berman, I would agree with you; like you, I'm a consultation guy.

*Supplementary – Cllr Berman*

I'm glad that Cllr De'Ath finds it somewhat amusing because it's taken myself and Cllr Hopkins tabling written questions to actually find out what's been going on at the junction of Cyncoed Road and Llanedeyrn Road where some weeks ago extensive roadworks were begun, but because none of us had been notified about it as local councillors we initially assumed it must be utilities carrying out those works. And then residents started getting in touch with us to talk about modifications being made to the junction, that the works were developing. Cllr Shimmin, my ward colleague, put in a member enquiry but didn't get a satisfactory response, so it's taken us till this meeting to discover that actually this is a Council scheme but the Council, due to an administrative error, had forgotten to consult or notify us as local councillors. This is a complete shambles. In fact, what the works are doing is bringing in something that I've been lobbying for for the last 2-3 years, which is to get crossings on the different arms of the junction. So could you please undertake to investigate what on Earth has happened here, and can you please give us an assurance that this sort of thing will not happen again?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

We've looked into this, the consultation packs for members in Penylan and Cyncoed were prepared and ready to go out, and just through pure human error that hasn't happened. I'm happy to apologise to you and your colleagues in Cyncoed ward. We'll take measures to ensure this doesn't happen again. I understand the public dimension of the consultation did happen, it's just ward members weren't notified. I agree with you that's not acceptable; it was completely unintentional, it wasn't something we've done deliberately. We do consult on dozens and dozens of these projects every year and ward members' feedback actually change what we do.

*Councillor Proctor to Cabinet Member for Climate Change*

What is the Council doing to tackle idling cars?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

It's pretty complicated because the Road Traffic Regulations of 2003 does allow enforcement of vehicle idling, but it only carries a fine of £20 and a fixed penalty notice can only be issued if the driver refuses to turn off the engine when asked to do so by an authorised officer. There are also some fairly obscure leniencies around that as well, such as if they can give various reasons for why their engine might be on. It essentially makes it an almost impossible task for officers to do it, and it's a very hands-on approach as well, having to get people to wind down their windows, and then the process that has to follow, and even at the end of that it's only £20. So instead what we do is messaging, media information for the public and businesses. But actually it's something we believe we could do better in terms of getting the message out to people around idling, especially on air quality.

*Supplementary – Cllr Proctor*

Idling cars are harmful to all of us, but especially to children because their lungs are small and they're still developing. Added to that, idling cars are especially bad outside schools. As you say, it's difficult to enforce, and giving fines as you say is a reactive measure which is only enforced if a driver refuses to turn an engine off. Is there anything we can do to be proactive about it, something that will stop drivers

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

doing it in the first place like an education piece or a campaign to inform people of the harmful effects of leaving their engines on?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

In terms of outside schools, there is some good work we do in the School Street scheme where we've taken cars out completely. I know that's not possible at all schools and there's limitations on some of those programmes. I think your ideas are really good, we should speak to officers and I'm happy to get them to get in contact with you about some of those, so maybe we can do some additional behaviour change through schools and other places where we've got vulnerable people.

*Councillor McEvoy to Leader of Council*

Could the Council Leader give an update on the situation with cleansing workers in Cardiff?

*Reply – Cllr Huw Thomas*

I infer from your question you are referring to the industrial dispute, so I would refer to the answer I provided earlier to the question from Cllr Berman on this matter. I would add, acknowledging that there has been disruption in terms of level of cleanliness on some of our streets, but also the fact that a significant number of our cleansing workers, a majority I believe, have continued to work over the last three months and the streets continue to be cleansed in challenging circumstances; I want to acknowledge their contribution as well and look forward now to the service recommencing at full capacity following the recent dispute.

*Supplementary – Cllr McEvoy*

As you know Leader, if you are on a temporary contract, there are some really basic things you cannot do, such as apply for a mortgage. Now, cleansing workers in Cardiff can be on temporary contracts for up to 4 years. As Leader of this Council, please justify that.

*Reply – Cllr Huw Thomas*

This point has been raised with me by Unite, and I think in general terms it is an issue I have considerable sympathy with. It's worth pointing out, of course, that in terms of agency and temporary contract positions, those very much reflect national practices and certainly what were in place when you were Deputy Leader. But on a moral point, this is an area where I am keen to make progress. Certainly part of the offer that has been made to Unite and discussed with all the unions through the trade union partnership is about reducing the time before a member of staff on an agency contract gets offered a temporary contract, and we have committed that we will look at whether that 3-year figure for a temporary contract can also be brought down, but that needs to be done on a collective basis and agreed with the other unions as well, but also needs to have due regard to practicalities and affordability considerations as well. But I certainly acknowledge the sentiment about reforming that area of work.

*Councillor Williams to Cabinet Member for Climate Change*

Recent criminal convictions following a corruption scandal at Cardiff Council have engulfed the administration. The Council have committed to undertaking a review of the systems and processes in place at the waste department. Huw Thomas, the Leader of the Council, said in a recent letter that waste managers, and I quote, 'have

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

his full confidence'. Now that surely rules him out from being involved in the appointment on who investigates and undertakes this internal review, because any Council employee would know what the Leader's view was before any investigation and review had even begun. For this reason, along with the scale of corruption at the Council, any review should be an external one. Therefore, to restore public trust and confidence in the waste department, would the Cabinet Member agree with me an external review is necessary, with a sufficiently broad terms of reference to empower the individual undertaking the review to follow the evidence and report on their findings in an independent and impartial manner?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

The review will be led by the Council's Section 151 officer, who has a statutory responsibility in these matters. It is absolutely appropriate that he leads this review. The review will also be reported, as stated, through the Governance and Audit Committee. The Committee will itself have a say on how the review will be scoped and undertaken. It is also important to note that the Governance and Audit Committee itself will play a key independent role in this work, and it is noted that it includes a mix of councillors and independent members.

*Supplementary – Cllr Williams*

Firstly, I should draw Members' attention to my register of interests, I'm not advertising my services to undertake this external review. But what I would say, Cllr Wild, is you have said in your response you feel it is entirely appropriate for the Section 151 officer to undertake the review, and I note that the report will go back to the Governance and Audit Committee, but crucially, why is it that an internal review is more appropriate than an external one? We've got a lot of issues going on in the waste department, there's a lot of background noise, there's a lot of irrelevant stuff going on, and I want to get to the bottom of this corruption scandal, a serious trial which has ended in criminal convictions, jail time for former Council officers. So I think the public need some reassurance that what we're going to do is we're going to be completely independent and impartial. We want to know what went on as elected Members, so I would ask you to clarify, why is it an internal review is being favoured rather than an external one?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

It was appalling the acts that took place and I commend the work of the Police in dealing with it. The interesting thing here is, we absolutely want to take it seriously, I think it is the right place, as I've mentioned there may well be external support needed for this, but that's for the professional view of the Section 151 officer, one of the best in the business, we've got some of the best professionals in Cardiff Council, we trust them to do it, and then we've got a brilliant Audit Committee that gives us all the oversight we need. Let's see what they come back, go through a really good process.

*Councillor Wood to Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning*

Can the Cabinet Member confirm how many existing bus routes are expected to be directed to call at the new bus station when it eventually opens and how much spare capacity there will be to accommodate additional services in the future?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

I'm sure you appreciate the bus station is being run by Transport for Wales rather than Cardiff Council. They are finalising some of those arrangements, I'm sure they'll be announcing them in due course. In terms of capacity, the new station will have a throughput of 60 buses an hour, so that's significant amounts of capacity so we don't see that being a particular issue.

*Supplementary – Cllr Wood*

Given the central role of increasing bus services in the Council's agenda for the One Planet and the LDP modal shift away from the car, are you at all concerned that, given that this station has much less capacity with only 14 bays than the previous one, or concerns that have been circulating that bus companies won't use the interchange, that this could impact on the Council's agenda of increasing bus patronage in the city?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

I'm not really concerned in terms of capacity. This is obviously a very difficult time for bus services generally, with the end of BES and the transition fund, it is really finances rather than infrastructure that concern me.

*Councillor Ash-Edwards to Cabinet Member for Culture, Parks and Events*

Heath Park plays an important part in the wellbeing of residents of Heath and surrounding neighbourhoods of the city, and councillors for the Heath ward are eager to further enhance amenities in the park for visitors, including the provision of permanent toilet facilities and a café. Unfortunately, in pursuing this ambition, it has come to light that parts of the park are held in a Council-managed trust, and progress has stalled. While appreciating the need for the Council to deal with matters in the right way, the delay is causing considerable frustration. Could you please provide an update on how the Council is progressing with resolving these matters, and how long the process might take?

*Reply – Cllr Huw Thomas on behalf of Cllr Burke*

I certainly understand the value of the park to stakeholders that you refer to in your question. This administration has worked hard to maintain the Green Flag status that Heath Park acquired in 2018. I myself have spent several happy hours in the park with my eldest child while awaiting the arrival of my youngest child in the nearby hospital.

I certainly share your desire to secure further improvements as well, and I can understand your frustration in the delay in progressing proposals for improvement. Now, as you aware, and you referenced the trust issues, the Council is undertaking a review of the management of land held in trust, not in particular to learn the lessons of what happened in the case of Maindy. A report is due to be presented to Cabinet in the new year that will deal with the governance and decision-making arrangements required for trusts, including the future management of trust land. This is to ensure that any new proposals can be considered properly by the Council as trustee and in the best interests of the trust. In the intervening period, officers from Cllr Burke's portfolio and the Council's strategic estates, legal services and procurement teams, are working together to develop a concession opportunity for a café, to enable the occupation of the former pitch and putt building which will see the toilet facilities opened and managed through an operator.

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*



*Councillor Davies to Cabinet Member for Tackling Poverty, Equality and Public Health*

Should an organisation in receipt of public funds to deliver youth services in Cardiff be publicly expressing overt political opinions?

*Reply – Cllr Bradbury*

You seem to be referring to a particular organisation, tell us what the actual organisation is and what you are accusing them of and then I will answer the question in the supplementary.

*Supplementary – Cllr Davies*

The organisation in question was the Urdd, it was one listed in the reports as receiving public funds, it's expressed an overt political opinion demanding a ceasefire in Gaza. Like I was going to try and say during the Committee, the view itself is not what's in question here, it's about the fact that in receipt of public money, working with young people, should it be making those overt political decisions, expressing those opinions? I'm so sorry I'm asking such an inappropriate, inflammatory question.

*Reply – Cllr Bradbury*

Lord Mayor, I'm quite happy to answer this question, I was just respecting the Chair in the Scrutiny Committee who had ruled the question out of order, and I advise any Member, including whether it's in full Council or Scrutiny, to always respect the Chair's judgement on matters that come forward.

But our main concern with any new grant including the Urdd's grant is that they deliver the service that they're paid to deliver, and they do, fantastically well, and if you are concerned, if you really are concerned about people's opinion influencing public policy decisions, particularly in the realms of foreign policy, you need to look closer to home, because the Good Law Project has found in an investigation that the Conservative Party has accepted at least £243,000 from Russian-associated donors, including £61,000 flowing into the Tory coffers in 2023 alone. This is not me saying this, it's the Good Law Project. I don't see the same concern of Conservative Members about that then they have about an independent organisation making a point about the crisis in the Middle East.

*Councillor Carter to Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning*

The Council wants to see more people switch from cars to buses, but the removal of the 51,53 bus has taken away a vital service for the residents of Llanedeyrn, Pentwyn, Penylan and Cyncoed to travel to the city centre. In light of the petitions submitted, will the Cabinet review the decision to not support the service?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

As I touched on with your colleague, there's a huge amount of uncertainty around bus funding going forward. We're reviewing our services, we still don't know what the picture will look like going forward. It's something you appreciate, you're one of our most knowledgeable Members in terms of transport, I'm really preaching to the converted in many ways at this time. It's just not possible to get a picture of what we're going to be able to support or not support, other than to say that we would like to support everything and add more buses, but it's not in our gift.

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

*Supplementary – Cllr Carter*

In light of what you've just said, how much of a priority is bus transport for this Council? We've seen a lot of positive investment on the capital side, obviously in rail and active travel; when it comes to the revenue investment of buses, we see very mixed messages from Welsh Government and it not being a priority for this Council, despite it being in your manifesto to be rolling out £1 bus fares. So is this still a priority for your Council?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

Bus services are absolutely a priority for this administration. In the next few months we'll be bringing forward a report on new bus priority measures that will greatly help services in the city. We already through the FRM money in supporting a number of services, and we are committed to £1 bus fares, new routes and other measures that are really needed, I think we can all agree on that, paid for by a fair and moderate road user charge.

*Councillor Lewis to Cabinet Member for Tackling Poverty, Equality and Public Health*  
Cardiff Council has once again played a key part in Wales HIV Testing Week just last week, playing its part in working towards the 2030 goal of zero new diagnoses by improving testing rates and tackling stigma. Can the Cabinet Member update Members on this year's campaign activities and advise on how Members can continue to play their part?

*Reply – Cllr Sangani*

Cardiff Council was pleased to support Fast Track Cardiff and Vale and work with the partners in support of the campaign to raise awareness of HIV during HIV Testing Week this month. This was promoted throughout the city centre and on digital screens in our community hubs and GP's surgeries. HIV 101 booklets were prominently displayed in all our hubs. In addition, Council staff supported an information stand at the University Hospital of Wales, where they were on hand to talk to hospital visitors about HIV and the importance of testing. This year's campaign has been the most successful to date in terms of promotion and reach online.

Data from Wales HIV Testing Week is still being gathered and analysed and it is still too early to provide any accurate findings. However, we have seen more than 2 million impressions on social media, and early data from Sexual Health Wales suggests that thousands of HIV test kits have been ordered online. I will of course provide further information when there will be more data available with me. Members can continue to support the campaign by reinforcing the importance of regular testing and how important it is to diagnose HIV as early as possible. The sooner that treatment starts the less likely that people will become seriously ill. Here in Wales anyone can order a free, confidential home test kit by visiting the Sexual Health Wales website. Cardiff became the first Fast Track city in 2020, and is proud to be leading the way in Wales in promoting the benefit of free regular HIV testing.

*Councillor Wood to Cabinet Member for Climate Change*

What has the Council since March 2023 to tackle the persistent and ongoing waste issues on Flint Street in Gabalfa ward?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

Street cleansing is scheduled to be undertaken on a bi-weekly basis, however, some of that has been affected by the recent strike action. The police team also visited Flint Street in August. Officers have been monitoring the position in Flint Street frequently since July following a series of incidents of incorrect waste presentation. It was identified that the storage of bins on the highway was contributing to waste being deposited in the surrounding area, so letters and instructional waste education presentation was provided to residents to confirm the change of service beforehand, and what was expected.

*Supplementary – Cllr Wood*

It's positive to hear that action is being taken, although I appreciate these challenges are inherently difficult to tackle in these circumstances. Unfortunately, this is one of several similar waste-related issues in our area that is impacting residents' quality of life, almost of whom are not responsible for causing the problems themselves but have to live with waste on the street, the rats and everything else that comes with loose waste. Bearing that in mind, would the Cabinet Member be willing to visit our ward to see these issues for himself and discuss how we may be able to resolve those issues?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

I should add, I know the properties that have been issued with formal Section 46 notices, so I think officers, these issues crop up across the city every now and then, so when they squeeze in and get those notices, when they get them presented, it often does have a positive impact, because you can then follow up with fixed penalty notices and things like that. I would be happy to visit as well, I haven't been up there for a while so it would be a pleasure to do that.

*Councillor Dilwar Ali to Cabinet Member for Housing and Communities*

Can the Cabinet Member provide an update as to whether the winter payments will continue this year for Lydstep Flats residents?

*Reply – Cllr Thorne*

I'm very pleased to say that the redevelopment work at Lydstep Flats is nearing completion. All blocks have had the window upgrades and external wall insulation fitted. Balconies have also been upgraded, and additional fire safety measures are being put in place. One block will have the scaffolding totally removed before Christmas, two other blocks will follow early in the new year. As the new insulation is in place, there is no requirement for the continuation of any winter compensation payments as all the flats will have benefited from these improvement works. However, if any resident of Lydstep Flats is struggling with cost of living, including worrying about their heating bills, they can of course contact the Council's Money Advice Team for advice and support. This can be obtained by visiting one of our hubs, or by calling the advice line 029 2087 1071, or by visiting the Money Advice Team website at [www.cardiffmoneyadvice.co.uk](http://www.cardiffmoneyadvice.co.uk)

90 : URGENT BUSINESS

There was no urgent business.

91 : COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

Council was asked to receive nominations and make appointments to current committee vacancies as set out in the report and in accordance with the approved allocation of seats and political group wishes.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Receive a nomination and appoint to the vacancy on the Committee, in accordance with the Party Group wishes, as set out in Table A and on the Amendment Sheet.

92 : APPOINTMENT OF LOCAL AUTHORITY GOVERNORS TO SCHOOL GOVERNING BODIES

Council was asked to appoint Local Authority School Governors to fill vacancies in accordance with the recommendations of the Local Authority Governor Panel

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Approve the new appointments of Local Authority Governors to the school Governing Bodies as set out in Appendix 1, each for a term of 4 years from the date of the appointment, in accordance with the recommendations of the Local Authority Governor Panel.

93 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

In accordance with Council Procedure Rule 17(f), Written Questions received for consideration together with the responses will be attached to the minutes.